Clonidine and methylphenidate were effective for attention deficit hyperactivity disorder in children with comorbid tics

Sources of funding: National Institutes of Health and the Tourette Syndrome Association.

For correspondence:
Dr R Kurlan,
University of Rochester Medical Center,
Rochester, NY, USA.

A modified version of this abstract and commentary also appears in ACP Journal Club and Evidence-Based Medicine.

QUESTION: In children with attention deficit hyperactivity disorder (ADHD) and Tourette’s syndrome (TS), what is the effect of clonidine (CLON), methylphenidate (MPH), or combined CLON and MPH?

Design
Randomised (allocation concealed*), blinded [all parties]**, placebo controlled trial with 16 weeks of follow up.

Setting
11 sites in the US.

Patients
136 children between 7 and 14 years of age (mean age 10 y, 85% boys) who met DSM-IV criteria for ADHD of any subtype and DSM-IV criteria for TS, chronic motor tic disorder, or chronic vocal tic disorder. Exclusion criteria included secondary tic disorder, major depression, pervasive developmental disorder, autism, mental retardation, eating disorders, and medical disorders precluding MPH or CLON use. Follow up was 80%.

Main outcome measures
Severity of ADHD symptoms (Conners Abbreviated Symptom Questionnaire for teachers [ASQ-Teacher]), tic severity (Yale Global Tic Severity Scale [YGTSS]), and global functioning (Children’s Global Assessment Scale [C-GAS]).

Main results
CLON alone or MPH alone and MPH combined were as follows: (i) MPH provides a broader therapeutic coverage of ADHD symptoms; (ii) MPH is superior to CLON in treating cognitive symptoms of inattention; (iii) CLON provides complementary benefit for treating hyperactive and impulsive behaviours; and (iv) combined CLON and MPH has the greatest effect on global functioning. With respect to adverse effects, combined CLON and MPH was most effective for lessening tic severity; yet, more patients receiving MPH alone reported adverse cardiac effects, but the study excluded patients with known cardiac problems.4

Conclusion
Clonidine or methylphenidate used alone and especially in combination were effective for attention deficit hyperactivity disorder in children with comorbid tics.

*See glossary.
†Information provided by author.

Outcome at 16 weeks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes at 16 weeks</th>
<th>Comparisons</th>
<th>Treatment effects (95% CI)</th>
<th>p Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADHD measured by Conners Abbreviated Symptom Questionnaire for Teachers</td>
<td>CLON v no CLON</td>
<td>3.2 (1.2 to 5.2)</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MPH v no MPH</td>
<td>3.2 (1.1 to 5.2)</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tic severity measured by the Yale Global Tic Severity Scale</td>
<td>CLON v MPH</td>
<td>6.3 (2.8 to 9.8)</td>
<td>&lt;0.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MPH v no MPH</td>
<td>4.8 (0.4 to 9.9)</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global functioning measured by the Children’s Global Assessment Scale</td>
<td>CLON v no CLON</td>
<td>6.9 (2.7 to 11.1)</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MPH v no MPH</td>
<td>7.7 (3.4 to 11.9)</td>
<td>0.0005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CLON v placebo</td>
<td>14.5 (7.2 to 21.9)</td>
<td>&lt;0.0001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

†Positive values show a beneficial effect of the medication. §Not significant

COMMENTARY

The well designed trial by the Tourette’s Syndrome Study Group addresses a number of questions related to treating ADHD in patients with tics. The differential effects of CLON and MPH were as follows: (i) MPH provides a broader therapeutic coverage of ADHD symptoms; (ii) MPH is superior to CLON in treating cognitive symptoms of inattention; (iii) CLON provides complementary benefit for treating hyperactive and impulsive behaviours; and (iv) combined CLON and MPH has the greatest effect on global functioning. With respect to adverse effects, combined CLON and MPH was most effective for lessening tic severity; yet, more patients receiving MPH alone reported tic as a reason for limiting further increases in their MPH dose. However, the reported frequency of tic worsening was the same across all treatments, which is supportive of other studies.4 CLON alone or in combination with MPH was not associated with adverse cardiac effects, but the study excluded patients with known cardiac problems and thus the safety of combined CLON and MPH was not addressed.

This study supports the effectiveness and safety of MPH, CLON, or the 2 drugs in combination for treating symptoms of ADHD in children with tics. Tics were not substantially worse in the treatment group than the placebo group; however, the duration of the trial (16 wks) is insufficient to determine the long term safety of MPH for tics. Furthermore, the study does not address the relation of MPH dose and the emergence of tics, which is an important clinical issue.2 This study is in agreement with other reports on the safety of using MPH and CLON. However, careful history, examination, and monitoring are still warranted at this time.3

Jeremy Goldberg, MB, FRCP
McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario, Canada


Clonidine or methylphenidate used alone and especially in combination were effective for attention deficit hyperactivity disorder in children with comorbid tics.

122 Volume 5 November 2002 EBMH www.ebmentalhealth.com Therapeutics

Evid Based Mental Health: first published as 10.1136/ebmh.5.4.122 on 1 November 2002. Downloaded from http://ebmh.bmj.com/ on March 21, 2022 by guest. Protected by copyright.