Clozapine may be more effective than olanzapine for reducing suicidal behaviour in people with schizophrenia at high risk


QUESTION: Compared with olanzapine, how effective is clozapine for preventing suicidal behaviour among people with schizophrenia or schizoaffective disorder?

Design
Randomised open label trial with masked outcome raters.

Setting
67 centres in 11 countries (Argentina, Canada, Chile, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Hungary, Italy, South Africa, United Kingdom, United States); March 1998 - February 2001.

Participants
980 people aged 16–65 years with schizophrenia (62%) or schizoaffective disorder (38%) considered at high risk for suicide based on current suicidal ideation, suicide attempts, or preventive hospitalisation within 3 years. Mean age 37 years; 39% women; 71% white; 27% treatment refractory.

Intervention
Participants were randomised to receive olanzapine or clozapine daily. The mean daily doses of olanzapine and clozapine prescribed were 16.6 mg and 274.2 mg, respectively. Doses were adjusted and additional treatments were provided by unmasked clinicians. All participants were seen weekly for 6 months and biweekly for an additional 18 months. Suicidal behaviour was assessed at each visit.

Main outcome measures
The main outcomes were reported suicide attempts, hospitalisations to prevent suicide, and ratings of “much worsening from baseline” (assessors blind to treatment allocation).

Main results
There was less suicidal behaviour in the clozapine group compared with olanzapine (hazard ratio 0.76, 95% CI 0.58 to 0.97, P=0.03, see table). People receiving clozapine had a reduced 2-year event rate (olanzapine 32.2% v clozapine 24.0%; 95% CI of the difference 0.92 to 0.14; NNT=13) and delay in time to event. The overall annual rate for attempted suicides (including suicide deaths) was 7.2% (8.7%) for olanzapine and 5.8% for clozapine. There were few deaths due to suicide during the 2-year study period (5 people in the clozapine group v 3 with olanzapine, P=0.73).

Conclusions
Clozapine prevented suicidal behaviour more effectively than olanzapine among people with schizophrenia or schizoaffective disorder at high risk of suicide.

Suicidal behaviour in high risk people with schizophrenia or schizoaffective disorder treated with clozapine or olanzapine

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Clozapine % (n=490)</th>
<th>Olanzapine % (n=490)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attempted suicide</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>13.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suicide ideation</td>
<td>26.1</td>
<td>32.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospitalised to prevent suicide</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>21.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rescue interventions to prevent suicide</td>
<td>24.1</td>
<td>31.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Much worsening from baseline” rating</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>32.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Required concomitant antidepressant treatment</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>55.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Required concomitant anxiolytics or soporifics</td>
<td>60.2</td>
<td>69.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: All P < 0.05.

COMMENTARY
The risk of suicide in schizophrenia is similar to that in mood disorders, and is much higher than in the general population. The risk of suicidal behaviour is therefore an important problem, complicating clinical care in schizophrenia. Meltzer et al describe a pivotal study of treating suicidal behaviour in schizophrenia and schizoaffective disorder. This is the first randomised controlled trial to suggest the superiority of clozapine over another atypical antipsychotic (olanzapine) for this indication. The study supports a number of previous uncontrolled observations.

Selecting olanzapine as the comparator treatment was somewhat ambitious given that this drug has some antidepressant effects. Furthermore, several studies have found that olanzapine and clozapine have comparable antipsychotic efficacy. The finding that clozapine is superior to olanzapine in this context is therefore even more remarkable.

Doses were based on clinical judgment. While the mean olanzapine dose was close to that used in the United States for schizophrenia, the clozapine dose was relatively low. The authors hypothesise that the low clozapine dose was because most patients were not treatment refractory. The mechanism of effectiveness of this low dose may be separate from that implicated in the general antipsychotic activity of clozapine (which typically requires higher doses).

It is important to note that antidepressants were prescribed concomitantly with olanzapine (55.1%) and clozapine (49.1%). The difference in concomitant antidepressant prescriptions was statistically significant. From a clinical standpoint, it is perhaps more important to realise that neither of the two antipsychotics alone had sufficient antidepressant or anti-suicidal effect. Instead, about half of the participants required antidepressant supplementation. Clinicians may be interested in an analysis investigating the effect of diagnosis (schizophrenia versus schizoaffective disorder) on this concomitant antidepressant use.

Overall, this is a landmark study that will influence clinical practice for years to come. The risk of suicide is a major cause of hospitalisation for people with schizophrenia or schizoaffective disorder. The other major cause of hospitalisation is risk of violence. Aggression against self (suicidal behaviour) and aggression against others have a number of common underlying neurobiological mechanisms. Clozapine is a relatively specific treatment for both conditions. An analysis of any measure of aggression or hostility in Meltzer’s database would be interesting.

Professor Jan Volavka, MD PhD
Nathan Kline Institute
New York University
New York, USA

Source of funding: Novartis Pharmaceuticals; William K. Warren Research Foundation; Donald Test Foundation Trust; Lydia Bryant Test Foundation Trust.

For correspondence: HY Melzer, Psychiatry Hospital at Vanderbuilt, Nashville, Tennessee, USA.
herbert.meltzer@mcmail.vanderbilt.edu
Clozapine may be more effective than olanzapine for reducing suicidal behaviour in people with schizophrenia at high risk

Evid Based Mental Health 2003 6: 93
doi: 10.1136/ebmh.6.3.93

Updated information and services can be found at:
http://ebmh.bmj.com/content/6/3/93

These include:

References
This article cites 1 articles, 0 of which you can access for free at:
http://ebmh.bmj.com/content/6/3/93#BIBL

Email alerting service
Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

Topic Collections
Articles on similar topics can be found in the following collections

- Suicide (psychiatry) (228)
- Schizophrenia spectrum (430)
- Drugs: psychiatry (344)
- Clinical trials (epidemiology) (989)
- Epidemiology (1570)

Notes

To request permissions go to:
http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to:
http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to:
http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/